

February 12, 2010

Jim Sleeth
Chemung County Library District
101 East Church Street
Elmira, New York 14901-2740

Re: Assessment of responses to Bookmobile RFB

Issue & Response

This Request for Bid ("RFB") was issued by the Chemung County Library District ("Library") on December 23, 2009 to six (6) potential vendors in an effort to determine responsive and capable manufacturers for your new Bookmobile. The RFB was issued with a deadline of February 5, 2010, allowing 44 days for vendor responses. At the time of RFB close, two (2) responses was recorded; one (1) from Matthews Specialty Vehicles, Inc. of Greensboro, NC, and one (1) from OBS, Inc. of Canton, OH.

Proposal Assessment

These proposals were assessed for completeness and specification adherence. Both proposals were found to be mainly responsive with the following exceptions and/or clarifications noted:

Matthews Specialty Vehicles

Bidder Qualification - No trade references given
Bidder Qualification - No financial institution references given
1.7.4 - Proposal does not list service centers
1.7.5 - Proposal does not list extended warranties
2.3.9 - 33,000lb GVWR
2.4.1.3 - 2010 EPA/CARB emission certification
2.4.1.7 - Frame mounted fuel/water separator
2.4.1.9 - 60mph or 70mph restriction only
2.4.1.11 - No wet cylinder sleeves
2.4.3.2 - 14,000lb front suspension
2.4.6.5 - No parking brake alarm
2.4.9.2 - G362 tires
2.4.10.2 - G362 tires
2.4.12.11 - No "flash to pass" feature
2.4.13.9 - No low battery audible alert

OBS, Inc.

2.3.1 - Overall length 33'-6"
2.4.1.1 - Cummins ISB-10, 285HP engine
2.4.1.11 - No wet cylinder sleeves
2.4.1.3 - 2010 EPA/CARB emission certification
2.4.2.1 - Allison 3000 PTS transmission
2.4.3.2 - 14,600lb front suspension
2.4.3.6 - TRW THP-60 power steering gear (18.2:1 ratio)
2.4.4.2 - 21,000lb rear suspension
2.4.5.1 - 18.1 CFM capacity
2.4.5.2 - 3 reservoirs with 17,730 cu. in. capacity
2.4.5.4 - Auto drains only
2.4.6.3 - Push/pull parking brake valve
2.4.9.2 - G661, 16-ply tires
2.4.10.2 - G661, 16-ply tires
2.4.12.1 - 240A alternator
2.5.15.1 - Egress windows additional (unknown) cost
2.5.17 - Mirror-Lite brand mirrors
3.1.1.6 - Classroom latch unavailable
3.1.1.8 - Steel step backs
3.1.2 - 26" x 46" rear window w/ screen
3.1.5 - No interior lever for manual step
3.1.6.2 - Single door, horizontally hinged
3.1.7.2 - Horizontal hinge
3.1.8.2 - Horizontal hinge
3.3.4 - Distribution panel on side wall
3.3.12 - Sensource brand people counter

Proposal Cost Summary

Following is the cost summary from these proposals:

	<u>Matthews Specialty Vehicles</u>	<u>OBS</u>
Delivery Time	240 days from receipt of order	90 - 110 days from receipt of shell
Payment Terms (Exhibit B)	20% down, 30% shell, balance on delivery	20% down, 30% shell, 45% delivery, 5% net 30 <i>(95% delivery, 5% net 30 also acceptable)</i>
Cost of Base Proposal:	\$209,667.00	\$207,500.00*
Alt. 1: Hybrid power system	\$4,676.00	\$5,900.00
Alt. 2: Wheelchair door and lift	\$9,513.00	\$9,640.00
Alt. 3: Air-powered auxiliary step	\$1,273.00	\$1,000.00
Alt. 4: Rear air-ride suspension	(Neway) \$4,776.00	\$1,345.00
Alt. 5: Front air-ride suspension	(Neway) \$1,802.00	\$745.00
Alt. 6: Electronic message board	\$5,126.00	\$4,600.00
Alt. 7: Graphics print and install	\$8,527.00	\$11,600.00
Cost with all options:	\$245,360.00	\$242,330.00

**Reflects -\$750 credit for omission of shoreline and transfer switch (reference pg. 19 of 27) and +\$750 addition for cab area egress windows per email from Barb Ferne 2/11/10 (reference pg. 11 of 27).*

Analysis

When reviewing the higher cost proposal from Matthews Specialty Vehicles, it was noted that key trade and financial institution references were acknowledged, but omitted without explanation on the Bidder Qualification Form. Additionally, product service centers and extended warranty options were missing from their proposal.

In contrast and with a lower base (and extended) cost, the proposal from OBS, Inc. was found to be comprehensively executed and submitted. Although the proposed vehicle is at the maximum of the Library's desired length, it details a vehicle with a more robust weight capacity, 240A alternator, 16-ply tires, 285HP engine, and superior 3000 PTS transmission; all deemed as value added features and of significant benefit to the Library. The OBS proposal also provides flexible payment terms for the Library.

During our analysis, several questions were clarified by Barb Ferne at OBS. A notation on page 11 of 27 indicated an up charge for the specified egress windows, but did not list a number. Barb indicated that she mistakenly omitted the number, and stated it at \$750. When this was included in the total, it was immediately offset by the -\$750 credit offered on page 19 of 27 for omission of a shore cord and transfer switch. This feature was not desired by the Library, but was assumed to be mistakenly omitted from our specification and included in their base cost.

Upon questioning about the inability to install the specified classroom style hardware on the door, I was informed that this was also an unintentional mistake. Barb learned via inquiry that this had been done on other OBS bookmobiles, and was possible using a different style door. She agreed to include the specified hardware and upgraded door in this proposal with no additional cost.

Another question surrounded the stated delivery time. Since they had stated a 90-110 day delivery from receipt of the shell (chassis and body), I inquired about current production times at Blue Bird bus (of which they have little control), and was told this morning that they are currently running between 90 and 120 days. This factored in, it is anticipated that the Library could expect delivery of their new bookmobile somewhere between 180 and 230 days from the order date.

Conclusion

Although this report contains a sizable list of exceptions/clarifications from OBS, it is important to note that the majority of these listings are clarifications, noted upon significant attention and analysis of our RFB specifications. The only notable sacrifice is the omission of the interior lever mechanism for the auxiliary step. I believe a suitable solution and/or alternative can be identified for this item during the pre-construction engineering phase, and the value added benefits of their proposed vehicle far outweigh this relatively minor sacrifice.

That said, I formally recommend the award of this Bookmobile contract to **OBS, Inc.** I believe this company and proposed vehicle better meet the needs of, and will serve the Chemung County Library District and its patrons well for many years to come.

I further look forward to continuing work on this exciting project and a very successful bookmobile delivery later this year. As always, please feel free to contact me with any question or comment.

At your service,



Michael Swendrowski
President